

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: November 21, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the October 24, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 2215 Magazine St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

3. 1123 St. Anthony St.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Timothy M McDonald, owner; New construction of a three-story, mixed-use building on a vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. [Please note: for the purposes of differentiating ARC comments across the McShane Street elevation, the structures have been numbered from left to right Building 1-7 with Building 7 wrapping the corner at St. Anthony St.] The ARC agreed the single parking space on the first level of Building 1 is not successful in that it reads like a false facade. This element does not align with the visual mass of a masonry building. The ARC recommends reducing the width of the opening and providing return walls on either side of the opening. At Building 2, they recommended reducing the width of the vehicular gate to approximately 12'-0", shifting it to the left and incorporating a pedestrian door. The ARC agreed the 'hut' like structure between Building 1 and 2 should be removed and allow the stair door at the building face to become an exterior door as well as allow for the installation of a matching window at the first floor and extension of the balcony above. At Building 4, they recommended reducing the oversized window at the first floor to match the adjacent windows. The ARC recommended enlarging the small windows at Building 5 to match all of the second floor windows on the McShane St elevation. At Building 7, the ARC agreed the parapet should return approximately 2'-0" at the St. Anthony street elevation and the brackets should be removed at the entry vestibule. In regards to the windows across the building(s) at the second floor, the ARC agreed that the windows with ankle height sills should be modified to be full-length or standard size windows (i.e. 3'-0" x 6'-0") for a cohesive streetfacing elevation. The ARC also recommended reducing the parapet height by 1'-0".

Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

4. 1115 St. Anthony St.

Application: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Timothy M McDonald, owner; New construction of a three-story, single-family residential building with parking at the first level.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the roof and balcony appeared out of balance and recommended shifting the dormer and side elevation windows up 1'-0", incorporating a box beam at the balcony, and changing the posts to box columns (approx. 4" x 8"). They agreed the vehicular entrance header height should align across the elevation and recommended adding a transom with vertical plain, solid metal security bars above to match the gate. Additionally, they recommended the window at the first level should be reduced to match those at the second level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

5. 4019 Chartres St.

Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.

6. 1427 Esplanade Ave.

Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.

7. 1447 Euterpe St.

Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.

8. 1615 Esplanade St.

Application: Randall Duplessis, applicant; Aulston G Taylor, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Speaker: Randall Duplessis spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The top portion of the entablature needs to be added (see neighboring house)
- The front porch should be 6'-0" in depth
- Decorative cast iron railing consistent with the Greek Revival style
- Front porch stair railing should come directly off columns
- The side porch should be split into 3 bays rather than 2 and the roof should be lowered to below the eave of the building

Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

9. 4019 Chartres St.

Application: Tracie Ashe, applicant; Mazant LLC, owner; Massing changes and roofline refinement of previously-approved new three-story hostel building.

Speakers: Ted Kelso spoke in favor of the application. Carolyn Leftwich spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing and roofline changes, with their recommendations and details to return to ARC for further review. The ARC agreed that the simplification of the massing was successful and consistent with their previous recommendations. The ARC also made the following recommendations on the design:

- Wood may be a more successful material for the shutters than metal or Hardie.
- Board-and-batten is not an appropriate material for the historic context. Metal paneling would be more appropriate; a width of 4" to 6" was recommended.
- The corner at Chartres St. and Mazant St. seems unresolved and should be made more cohesive with the rest of the design. Consider eliminating the angled corner as a means of making it less complex.
- The overhang at the corner of Royal St. and Mazant St. seems redundant, as it only provides shelter to windows in that location and the entrance is already protected in the entry alcove. It is not clear whether the awning is an independent element or an integrated part of the building; if the overhang element remains, it should be detailed to read more as more integral to the building.
- There is too much space between the second floor windows and the eave on the two-story portion to the right of the driveway entrance on Mazant St. Window size and location should be adjusted to provide a better ratio of window to wall.
- Options should be studied to reduce the amount of noise transmission at the parking lot, including alternate building materials, permeable paving systems, and substantial landscaping between the parking lot and the property line.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 1447 Euterpe St.

Application: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; Gregory L II Lacy, owner; Renovation and camelback addition to existing one story residential building

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the massing of the camelback is atypical but due to the site restraints it is appropriate. The proposed gable window should fit within the existing vent opening. The existing 2/2 windows at the front elevation should remain to match existing, windows at the second floor addition should match in configuration. The existing 6/6 windows at the side elevations in the front room should remain on either side as existing.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 3815 Royal St.
Application: Seth Welty, applicant; Georgia Y Graham, owner; One-story addition to existing one-story residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the Option 1 design, with details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC agreed that the first option, with the ridge of the new addition set at the same height as the ridge of the existing addition, was more successful in maintaining the story of the evolution of the building.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
12. 925-927 Sixth St.
Application: Gunner Guidry - Guns Modern, applicant; Sunsin Enterprises, owner; New construction of two-family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that windows at the front of the camelback should be evenly spaced and the stair at the front porch should be enlarged to match the width of the bay.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
13. 1801 Henriette Delille St.
Application: Robert Roth, applicant; Henry B III Eckers, owner; Structural renovation of existing one-story commercial building to include modification to front facade, second floor addition and balcony.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made note of the evolution of this building typology along the St. Claude Avenue Corridor where full-story building additions were constructed to incorporate storefront commercial space at the ground floor and residences above. The ARC agreed increasing the mass at this corner is successful and contributes to the character of the area and respects the context of the building and its streetscape. With regards to the site, the ARC recommended meeting with the Zoning Administrator to confirm Open Space requirements in this district. The ARC agreed that the location of the rear stair does not appear to contribute to the Open Space requirements nor is it an HDLC approvable condition. The ARC recommended removing and relocating the rear stair to the interior. They agreed the original openings at the front elevation should remain and changing the handrails at the balcony to vertical pickets.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

14. 1805 Henriette Delille St.
Application: Robert Roth, applicant; Henry B III Eckers, owner; Renovation of existing one-story commercial building to single-family residential building with camelback addition.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed retaining the original storefront is successful. It retains the original character of this ensemble of structure and the 'quirkiness' of St Claude Avenue. Though the camelback is slightly forward of the traditional location, it is set far enough into the site to be visually unobtrusive on this block.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments
15. 1427 Esplanade Ave
Application: Christopher Mardis, applicant; Coulon Development LLC, owner; New construction of six-unit, three-story residence.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer action on this application until drawings that reflect the original approval are submitted. The ARC noted that the drawings submitted do not reflect the proportions and details that received conceptual approval.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
16. 2514 Chartres St.
Application: Dennis Bulliung, applicant; Jonathan B Bulliung, owner; Construct 1956 sq ft 2-story addition and renovate 2-family dwelling as per plans.
Speaker: Chelsea Bilyeu spoke in favor of the application.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended lowering the roof pitch (suggested 6:12), changing the double-hung windows to casements, and simplify the detailing as much as possible.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
17. 4991 Burgundy St.
Application: John C. Williams, applicant; 4900 N Rampart LLC, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residence.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC also recommended that a box beam be added on the first floor porch.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

18. 1213 Magazine St.
Application: Kelly Johnson, applicant; 1209 -11 Magazine LLC, owner; New construction of a 3-story, 2-family residential building on vacant lot.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC noted that the atypical massing was not successful for the district, the third floor should be better integrated within the roof of the building and the building should be studied in relation to the surrounding context. The window to wall ratio at the side elevation, and the space between the window headers and roof eave is awkward. Raising the roof pitch may mitigate that transition. The proposed floor to ceiling heights may read low in context, please submit a scaled context drawing for review at the upcoming meeting. The proposed transoms over the windows at the front elevation are not appropriate and the windows should meet the balcony floor.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
19. 1020 Kentucky St.
Application: Annie Moore, applicant; Judith D Halverson, owner; Erect a temporary high tunnel greenhouse on a vacant lot.
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
20. 2633 Chartres St.
Application: Steve Clarke, applicant; Stephen L Clarke, owner; Renovation and two-story addition to existing one-story residential building.
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended contacting the City Planning Commission as well as the Board of Zoning Adjustments to investigate provisions and/or waivers for parcels that historically had more than one (1) structure on them. Based on those discussions, the ARC was in agreement that should this proposal be modified to show two (2) detached structures, this condition would be approvable as well, provided the balcony of the accessory structure was brought across the entire side elevation. Details for this modification would also require review at the Staff Level. As presented, the ARC recommended the dormers at the original brick between post Creole cottage be modified to match the original arched top condition. They also agreed that a detailed proposal regarding the repair of the existing brick-between-post construction should be further reviewed with the HDLC Staff. Regarding the addition, the ARC recommended incorporating posts at the balcony as well as modifying the French doors to reflect more traditional French door configuration and appearance.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:

21. 323 Pelican St.
Application: Robert Pell, applicant; Joel B Snodgrass, owner; Demolition of 446 SF of existing rear additions and construction of new 1,208 SF addition at rear.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
22. 2223 Carondelet St.
Application: Looney Ricks Kiss/LRK, LLC, applicant; 2223 Carondelet, LLC, owner; New construction of two (2) townhouses on a vacant lot.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC recommended meeting with the Zoning Administrator regarding the parking requirements for this district. The parking area(s) per the site plan appear to be in conflict with the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance and may require relocation. Regarding the structure, the ARC recommended removing the faux balconies and plane changes across the front elevation. They agreed that the dormers should be modified to show more traditional proportions. The windows should be enlarged to displace the trim and space shown around the casing. Additionally, the ARC recommended incorporating one or two-story porches at the front elevation, modifying the ankle height windows to show either full-length or standard size windows (3'-0" x 6'-0"), reducing the overhangs at the side elevations, and removing the window aprons.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
23. 1738 N Rampart St.
Application: Diane Hickman, applicant; Jbcb LLC, owner; New construction of two-story two-family building at the rear of the property.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended contacting the State Historic Preservation Office to confirm whether a new structure on a parcel with existing historic structures would affect the Historic Tax Credits requirements.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
24. 636 First St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.
25. 951 St Mary St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.

26. 953 St Mary St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.